Has the Number of Dues Paying City Union Members Changed Since the Janus Ruling?

In late June 2018, the United States Supreme Court issued a much anticipated ruling in Janus v. AFSCME, which challenged the longstanding right of public-sector unions to collect fees from nonunion employees who enjoy wage hikes and other benefits won through collective bargaining. The court ruled in a 5-4 decision that employees who are not union members but are working in job titles that are union-represented have the right to fully opt out of partial dues payments known as “agency fees.”

Many expected the ruling would have dire effects on union membership and revenue. We have taken an early look, examining the last three and a half years of city employee paycheck deductions for union dues, including the six months following the Janus decision. These deductions are for all dues—full dues and agency fees—so we cannot link changes in the number of dues payers directly to Janus.

- Adjusting for “seasonal” employees like substitute teachers and lifeguards, who either do not collect paychecks in summer months or do so exclusively in the summer, over 11,000 fewer full-time city employees paid union dues in December 2018 than in June—a reduction of 3.5 percent.
- Though official city headcounts are not yet available past September, the number of city employees with deductions for union dues has generally trended in line with citywide headcount published by the Office of Management and Budget; numbers from the first six months since the Janus ruling suggest that this relationship may be changing.
- District Council 37, the second largest city union by number of dues payers, experienced the largest decline, with a 7.1 percent reduction in six months. The United Federation of Teachers is the only major union with the number of dues payers to remain relatively stable since June. It is interesting to note that the sanitation workers union had an increase of 455, or 7 percent, in dues-paying members over the same period.
- In spite of the downward trend, unions have collected almost $600,000 more per month on average when compared with the same period in the prior year. This is due to an average 6.3 percent increase in per-member deductions.1

Update: After publication IBO learned that due to an unusual lag stemming from a policy change, over 450 cadets in the October Police Academy class were among the 757 Police Benevolent Association members not paying dues. As of January, they became dues-paying members.

Sources: Mayor’s Office of Management and Budget; New York City Payroll Management System

Note: “The United Federation of Teachers’ per-member dues revenue grew substantially due to an infusion of dues collected on pay increases for employees and retirees from recent collective bargaining agreements. Excluding members of the United Federation of Teachers the per-member deductions have increased by 3.3 percent over the same period last year.”

Share on

Prepared by Robert Callahan
New York City Independent Budget Office